

Minutes
Historic Resources Board
City Commission Room, City Hall
1101 Poyntz Avenue
October 25, 2010
4:00 p.m.

Members Present: Tom Roberts, Vice Chair; Patrick Schaub; Michael Dudek; Dea Brokesh.

Members Absent: George Lauppe; Michael Krysko.

Others Present: Haley Rose; Cheryl Collins; Kathy Dzewaltowski; Christy Davis; Chuck Bartlett; Kurt Roterling; Chris Elsey; Bryan Elsey; Linda Glasgow.

Staff Present: Cam Moeller, Planner II; Lance Evans, Senior Planner; Rob Ott, City Engineer.

1. Consider the minutes of the September 27, 2010, and October 11, 2010, Historic Resources Board meetings.

Brokesh moved that the Board approve the September 27, 2010 minutes. Schaub seconded the motion, which passed on a vote of 4-0.

Dudek moved that the Board approve the October 11, 2010 minutes. Brokesh seconded the motion, which passed on a vote of 4-0.

2. Environs Review

Multi-Family Project, Planned Unit Development, 2216 Claflin Road (within environs of Goodnow Memorial Home)

Moeller provided an overview of the proposal. Moeller noted that the Board would be reviewing both the proposed demolition of the existing house on the site and the Planned Unit Development proposal for new residential townhomes, consisting of twenty-nine four-bedroom units.

Chris Elsey, applicant, presented the plans to the Board. Elsey said there would be a mix of ornamental and canopy trees in the front yard facing Claflin Road. Elsey showed examples of the cultured stone product that is to be incorporated into the building design. Elsey described the cultured stone as having a “native limestone look” with good texture and durability, and said it will be compatible with the historic environs.

Dudek asked about the setback of the building fronting Claflin Road. Elsey said it will be set back twenty-five feet from the sidewalk. Brokesh asked how the setback compares to other developments within the environs. Elsey said he believed the setback was similar to that of the building fronting Claflin within the Chase Manhattan apartment complex, located to the west.

Brokesh asked about the species of trees planned. Elsey said there would be pear trees and ornamental red maples.

The Board discussed the length of the proposed buildings and opportunities to break down the scale of the buildings into smaller units.

Kathy Dzewaltowski asked about previous reviews of other projects within the environs and how they may factor into the review of the current proposal.

Cheryl Collins said she was concerned the amount of parking provided is inadequate and that overflow parking will affect the Riley County Historical Museum.

City staff provided the Board with a copy of a 1991 letter from the State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO) which outlined its review of the Chase Manhattan apartment complex at that time. Schaub summarized the content of the letter, which described the developer as having made concessions to address concerns of the SHPO related to the development's impact on the environs of the Goodnow Memorial Home, which included making plan modifications to reduce the building scale and provide dense landscaping.

Schaub said the proposed building fronting onto Claflin Road currently shows little relief on the façade. Schaub suggested some type of offset on the façade as a way to address that deficiency. Roberts read from the 1991 SHPO letter, which notes that building mass had been reduced with that development by shifting portions of the building to create shadow lines and divisions. Schaub said that the addition of gables and balconies also impact the perceived scale of the building.

City staff provided the Board with information regarding the setbacks within the Chase Manhattan complex. Roberts noted that site plan and aerial photo provided indicate that the setback of the Chase Manhattan apartment building fronting Claflin Road is at least fifty (50) feet from the property line.

Brokesh asked whether the use of vinyl siding is an issue. Schaub said it was his opinion that the proposed materials do not rise to the level of affecting the environs in this case.

Linda Glasgow noted that Katrina Ringler from SHPO had mentioned Hardie Board siding by name during the Board's training session as a preferable alternative to vinyl siding.

Schaub moved that the Board find that the proposed removal of the existing house meets *The Standards and Guidelines for Evaluating the Effect of Projects on Environs* and will not encroach upon, damage or destroy any listed historic property or its environs.

Dudek seconded the motion, which passed on a vote of 4-0.

Dudek said the proposed development will have a dramatic effect on the environs of the Goodnow Memorial Home.

Schaub said that if the Board uses SHPO's review of Chase Manhattan as a reference regarding the relevant issues, then breaking down the scale of the building is a key consideration. Roberts, reading through the letter, also identified the provision of dense screening as another key issue.

Schaub moved that the Board find that the proposed Claflin Townhomes PUD does not meet *The Standards and Guidelines for Evaluating the Effect of Projects on Environs*, specifically does not meet Standard #6, and will encroach upon, damage or destroy the environs of the Goodnow Memorial Home. The Board recommended that the plans be revised to reduce the

perceived scale of the building facing Claflin Road and to incorporate additional landscaping in the front yard along Claflin Road.

Dudek seconded the motion, which passed on a vote of 4-0.

3. Discussion of preliminary concepts for McCall Road extension project

Chuck Bartlett, Alfred Benesch & Company, and Christy Davis, Davis Preservation, gave an overview of the McCall Road extension project.

Bartlett explained the primary purpose of the extension of McCall Road is to alleviate the chronic traffic problem at the intersection of Tuttle Creek Boulevard and Bluemont Avenue. Bartlett said that, in addition to the street realignments, project components will include streetscape design, an evaluation of storm detention, and provision of green space.

Davis explained that a survey of historic resources within the area will be conducted as part of the federal Section 106 process. Davis talked about her initial assessment of resources. Davis said that this area has developed over a long period of time and includes structures from different eras with many different styles. Davis said there is not a concentration of resources to form a historic district.

Linda Glasgow congratulated the City for selecting a project team that involves someone of the caliber of Davis. Glasgow said an important resource within these neighborhoods is the historic grid street pattern, and that it should be taken into consideration with the project.

Bartlett said the intent of the project is to preserve the integrity of the neighborhoods to the west.

Bartlett said a public input meeting will be held on November 3rd.

4. HRB Action Plan: High/immediate priority projects

By acclamation, the Board tabled discussion and decided to schedule a special Work Session for November 8th to discuss the HRB Action Plan.

5. Discussion of preservation workshops and/or summits

By acclamation, the Board tabled discussion until the November 8th Work Session.

6. Announcements and Updates

The Board was provided a brief update about the African-American Cultural Resources survey project.

7. Future Items

There was no further discussion of Future Items.

8. Upcoming Meetings

- Monday, November 8, 2010
- Monday, November 22, 2010
- Monday, December 20, 2010

9. Adjourn

There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,

Cam Moeller, AICP, Planner II

CM/cm
102510